Apalachicola Bay System Initiative Community Advisory Board

Meeting 6 Phase IV – 30 November 2022

Meeting Objectives

Updated Workplan and Schedule

Modeled Scenarios

Jeff A. Blair

FacilitatedSolutionsJB@gmail.com
http://facilitatedsolutions.org

CAB Meeting Participation Guiding Principles

- **Four Personal Guiding Principles:** Be impeccable with your word, don't take things personally, don't make assumptions, and always do your best.
- **Overarching Guiding Principle:** Seek first to understand, and then seek to be understood.

We Will Be Successful And Have Good Conversation When:

- All voices are invited, respected and heard.
- All experiences are treated as valid.
- We listen to each other actively, attentively, and respectfully.
- We observe time frames.
- We seek common ground and action.
- There is full and active attendance.
- We make the time and space to connect with each other.
- We participate actively and share opinions in the conversation—engage fully in this process.

CAB Meeting Objectives 30 November 2022
Agenda Item #3

- Approval of Procedural Items (Agenda & Report)
- Review of Updated Workplan and Meeting Schedule
- Science and Data Collection Update
- FWC (NFWF 2) Restoration Project Update
- CAB Successor Group, RFWG, Community Outreach Updates
- Review and Discuss Comments from October 2022 Community Workshops
- Fisheries Model Simulation Results Discussion
- Agreement on Next Suite of Scenarios for Fisheries Model Simulations
- Public Comment
- Next Steps: Action & Agenda Items for 1 February 2023

ABSI Community Advisory Board to Date

- **Phase I (2019). Standing up and Organization of the ABSI CAB** — *May 2019 – Dec. 2019 (Assessment, Questionnaire, and 2 CAB Meetings)* ***Complete***
- **Phase II (2020). Scoping of Issues, Identification of Performance Measures & Strategies** — *Jan. 2020 – Dec. 2020 (7 CAB Meeting and 1 Oystermen's Workshop)* ***Complete***
- **Phase III (2021). Building Consensus on CAB Recommendations for the ABS Ecosystem-Based Adaptive Management and Restoration Plan** — Adoption of Final Draft Management and Restoration Plan Framework for Phase IV Evaluation — *Jan. 2021 – Nov. 2021 (7 CAB Meeting and 2 Oystermen's Workshops)* ***Complete***

ABSI Community Advisory Board Current

- **Phase IV (2022). Evaluation of Draft Adaptive Management and Restoration Plan Framework's Restoration and Management Strategies, Restoration Projects Selection and Implementation, and Funding Planning** — *Dec. 2021 – Dec. 2022 (6 CAB Meetings, 2 Public Workshops)* — ***Complete after November Meeting***

- **Phase V (2023). Evaluation and Finalization of Recommendations for Inclusion in the *ABS Ecosystem-Based Adaptive Management and Restoration Plan*, Restoration Projects Selection and Implementation, and Funding Planning** — *Jan. 2023 – Dec. 2023 (6 CAB Meetings, 3 Public Workshops)* — ***Status Initiate January 2023***

ABSI CAB Phase IV Schedule

Remaining Phase IV Meetings – 2022

- **Meeting 6 – November 30, 2022 (ANERR)**
  Science and data update. FWC-NFWF 2 Restoration update. Committee reports. Community engagement initiative update. Review and discussion of Oystermen's Workshop and Community Workshop input. Fisheries Model simulation results & scenarios refinements. Agreement on next suite of scenarios for model simulations. Public comment.

ABSI CAB Phase V Overview

- **CAB Phase V (2023).** Evaluation and Finalization of Recommendations for Inclusion in the *ABS Ecosystem-Based Adaptive Management and Restoration Plan*, Restoration Projects Selection and Implementation, and Funding Planning.
- The CAB will evaluate the priority and efficacy of scenarios and associated actions and identify specific recommended restoration projects and management approaches for inclusion in the Apalachicola Bay System Ecosystem-Based Adaptive Management and Restoration Plan (Plan). The CAB will vote to approve their package of consensus recommendations during their November 2023 meeting. ***Status – Initiate January 2023.***
- **Restoration Funding Working Group (RFWG).** Initiated in late 2021 the Restoration Funding Working Group's role is to seek resources and political, governmental, and organizational support for the CAB's priority recommendations. ***Initiated***

ABSI CAB Phase V Overview

- **CAB Successor Group.** The CAB Successor Group will be ready to convene when the CAB completes their work on the Apalachicola Bay System Ecosystem-Based Adaptive Management and Restoration Plan. The Successor Group's role will be to organize a group of key stakeholders committed to working collaboratively for the long-term, once the CAB process is complete and to ensure that the Plan is implemented, monitored, and adaptively managed over time and has the support of the Community. The CAB Successor Group process will formally initiate January 2024. ***Status – Organizing. Formal Initiation January 2024.***

CAB ABSI Community Engagement. 3 Community Workshops Planned.

- **Community Workshop 1.** April 12, 2023. Community input on ABSI Restoration Experiments, FWC Restoration Project, and management scenarios for modeling.
- **Community Workshop 2.** July 26, 2023. Community input on the CAB's proposed scenarios for modeling and preliminary recommendations for the Apalachicola Bay System Ecosystem-Based Adaptive Management and Restoration Plan.
- **Community Workshop 3.** October 24, 2023. Community input on the CAB's recommendations for the Apalachicola Bay System Ecosystem-Based Adaptive Management and Restoration Plan.

ABSI CAB Phase V Schedule

- **Meeting 1 – February 1, 2023 (ANERR)**

  Initiation of Phase V of ABSI. ABSI science and data collection and restoration project updates. Sub-committee reports and public engagement initiative update. Review and discussion of Fisheries Model simulation results for revised priority Habitat Restoration (Goal A) and Fisheries Management (Goal B) scenarios. Agreement on next suite of scenarios for model simulations. Public comment.

- **Meeting 2 – April 12, 2023 (ANERR)**

  ABSI science and data collection and restoration project updates. Sub-committee reports and public engagement initiative update. Review and discussion of Fisheries Model simulation results for revised priority Habitat Restoration (Goal A) and Fisheries Management (Goal B) scenarios. Agreement on next suite of scenarios for model simulations. Public comment.

- **Meeting 3 – May 31, 2023 (ANERR)**

  ABSI science and data collection and restoration project updates. Sub-committee reports and public engagement initiative update. Review and discussion of Community Workshop input. Finalize and adopt recommendations for strategies and actions (components) for inclusion in the Apalachicola Bay System Ecosystem-Based Adaptive Management and Restoration Plan (Plan) and submit to FSUCML. Public comment.

ABSI CAB Phase V Schedule

- **Meeting 4 – July 26, 2023 (ANERR)**
  Initiation of Phase V of ABSI. ABSI science and data collection and restoration project updates. Sub-committee reports and public engagement initiative update. Review and discussion of Fisheries Model simulation results for revised priority Habitat Restoration (Goal A) and Fisheries Management (Goal B) scenarios. Agreement on next suite of scenarios for model simulations. Public comment.
- **Meeting 5 – September 27, 2023 (ANERR)**
  ABSI science and data collection and restoration project updates. Sub-committee reports and public engagement initiative update. Review and discussion of Community Workshop input. Review and discussion of Fisheries Model simulation results for revised priority Habitat Restoration (Goal A) and Fisheries Management (Goal B) scenarios. Agreement on next suite of scenarios for model simulations. Public comment.
- **Meeting 6 – November 29, 2023 (ANERR)**
  ABSI science and data collection and restoration project updates. Sub-committee reports and public engagement initiative update. Review and discussion of Community Workshop input. Finalize and adopt recommendations for strategies and actions (components) for inclusion in the Apalachicola Bay System Ecosystem-Based Adaptive Management and Restoration Plan (Plan) and submit to FSUCML. Public comment.

Questions or Comments on Workplan and Schedule

Jeff A. Blair

FaciltatedSolutionsJB@gmail.com

http://facilitatedsolutions.org

Apalachicola Bay System Initiative Community Advisory Board

Meeting 6 Phase IV – 30 November 2022

Management Scenarios for Modeling

Jeff A. Blair

Facilita[illegible]ail.com
http://facilitatedsolutions.org

Scenarios for Modeling - Agenda Item #9

Previous Scenarios Modeled (18 October 2022)

- Depensation, Collapse, Restoration.
- Restoration and Sustainable Fishing.
- Alternative Fisheries Management Approaches.

Current Scenarios Modeled (30 November 2022)

- Model a Summer oyster fishery closure of June-August.
- New Scenario: Ongoing shelling and restoration (put and take).
- Stochasticity—adding randomness (events) to the model.
- Run a Sensitivity Analysis to change the slope of the Depensation Curve (Standard Deviation) to see what happens (shell dynamics oyster simulations - relationships).
- Combination of management strategies with above scenarios (i.e., active management, open fishery, limited entry, seasons)
- Work on improving model scaling.

Future Scenarios for Modeling
Agenda Item #10

Future Scenarios

- An Active harvest management scenario similar to the AL approach using monitoring and an oyster abundance minimum density threshold.
- Different management strategies under a range of different assumptions to see what works best.
- A put-and-take sustainable wild oyster harvest fishery.
- Restoration approaches using data from the restoration projects and the restoration experiments and pilot projects (specific locations, size, height/spatial configurations, type of cultch material, density of cultch, etc.).
- A combination of limited entry and active management.

Future Scenarios for Modeling

When the Model Can Be Expanded to a Spatially Explicit Platform

- Opening and closing specific oyster bars and potentially even parts of specific oyster bars based on the metrics for sustainability of the resource (e.g., oyster density).
- Different scenarios with the Bay wide-open and various areas of the Bay closed.
- Develop and maintain one area of the Bay (e.g., Cat Point) for high intensity commercial oyster harvesting, and the rest of the Bay will be set aside as protected areas (MPA/Sanctuaries) to provide ecosystem services such as water filtration and marine species habitat, and also to provide brood stock/spat source for the system.
- Updated periodic oyster population evaluations are being conducted and used as the metric for how much and when harvesting is allowed.
- Total Allowable Catch (TAC) as a component of a limited entry and/or minimum density active managed scenarios.
- Seasonal closures.
- Consider the size, spatial configuration, amount and location for oyster reef habitat restoration initiatives.

ASSUMPTIONS FOR MODELING

Modeled Simulations Include

- Closed seasons
- Bag limits
- Potential for bioeconomic entry (i.e., based on assumptions about profitability and variables costs, so not capped at number of trips/participants), as is most recent status quo.
- Fixed effort remains an options, as does, allowing for an effort cap with bioeconomic operations below that.
- Discard mortality applied to oysters captured but not harvested.
- Potential for density dependent catchability which there is some evidence may occur.

** The models still include shell budget information.*

Apalachicola Bay System Initiative Community Advisory Board

Meeting 6 – 30 November 2022

Overarching Considerations for Modeling

Jeff A. Blair

Facilitated Solutions

FacilitatedSolutionsJB@gmail.com
http://facilitatedsolutions.org

Overarching Considerations for Model Results

- The CAB is exploring proposed strategies and scenarios (combinations of strategies or options) acknowledging that all options require investments, commitments, and trade-offs and must be implemented collectively for the package of recommendations to succeed. As the CAB moves forward evaluating and selecting scenarios for the package of consensus recommendations, the entire package must be implemented and work together synergistically and accomplish the desired outcome.
- It should be further understood that the results of modeling simulations must be evaluated in relation to the confidence the modeler and stakeholders have in the data and the assumptions used. The level of confidence is directly proportional to the level of uncertainty for the results and must be considered when interpreting the simulation results for the various scenarios evaluated.
- The ABSI Project Team's commitment is to be transparent and realistically manage expectations, and to clarify where appropriate what the implications, requirements, and trade-offs are for any given package of recommendations.

Overarching Considerations for Model Results

- As the CAB moves forward with the process of evaluating scenarios that will ultimately evolve into the CAB's package of consensus recommendations predicted to achieve the desired outcomes for the ABS, the scenarios (strategies) must be implemented as a package and work together synergistically, and strategies should not be seen as stand-alone alternatives.
- For the CAB's consensus recommendations to be successful and have the best chance for funding and implementation, the recommendations should balance predicted outcomes socially, politically, culturally, and economically based on an analysis of sustainable harvest potential (jobs) and ecosystem services, including but not limited to creating habitat and the resultant food source for hundreds of species including commercially valuable fish, water quality, shore protection, and storm protection, as well as other benefits including but not limited to recreational activities and tourism.